In What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be Implemented?: A Literature Review

Fatmawati Aditya Febrita¹, Eko Prasojo²
¹,² Universitas Indonesia
Email: fatmawaty.aditya@ui.ac.id

* Correspondence: fatmawaty.aditya@ui.ac.id

KEYWORDS
Flexible Working Arrangement (FWA); Organization; Technology.

ABSTRACT
A new paradigm has emerged in the world of work amidst the widespread of the COVID-19 pandemic. One concept that has garnered attention is the "Flexible Working Arrangement." This flexible approach to work has become crucial as the pandemic has forced many companies and employees to adapt to uncertain and ever-changing circumstances. In facing these challenges, flexibility in carrying out work activities has become increasingly important. Flexible Working Arrangement provides an effective solution to overcome the obstacles arising from social restrictions and remote work. FWA has not been fully implemented by ASN, even though Presidential Decree 21 of 2023 has been issued, as a form of legal certainty for the flexible policy and the success of the WFH work system during Covid-19. By leveraging technology and digital communication, workers can remain productive without being physically present in the office. This approach enables individuals to work from home, manage a more flexible work schedule, and utilize their time more efficiently. In this paragraph, we will further discuss the benefits and implications of Flexible Working Arrangement in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic.

Introduction
The World Health Organization (WHO) officially declared Covid-19 as a Pandemic on Wednesday, March 11, 2020. According to the Minister of Health at that time, Terawan Agus Putranto, work activities contributed to the largest population and high mobility so that the business world and the working community had a major contribution in the transmission of covid which caused interactions caused by work activities. The potential for transmission of the COVID-19 virus is very high in closed areas without good ventilation (Correia, Rodrigues, Da Silva, & Gonçalves, 2020).

Kep Menkes Number HK.01.07/MENKES/328/2020 concerning Guidelines for the Prevention and Control of Covid-19 in Office and Industrial Workplaces in Supporting Business Continuity in a Pandemic Situation (Nurhaliza, 2020). In the guide, there are employee protection measures that must be carried out by business actors. In addition to preparing workplaces in accordance with health protocols, setting work shift
In What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be implemented?: A literature review

schedules is a prerequisite for the implementation of this policy. The application of physical distancing in all work activities by regulating a minimum distance of 1 meter between workers. The possibility of working remotely can reduce the risk of exposure to diseases and economic shocks associated with government actions to combat the Covid-19 pandemic (Alipour, Falck, & Schüller, 2023).

Parker (2020) revealed that this was done on the demand to reduce office density, redesign existing work systems, office governance based on crisis situations, and improve technology in crisis situations. Not only focusing on physical and material changes, the government must also be able to explore the problems and impacts of this pandemic. In line with this, Mallet (Mallet, Marks, & Skountridaki, 2020) explained that when the government began to prepare risk factors in the WFH work system, it was important for the government and the public to try to understand the phenomenon critically and comprehensively.

A study by Beauregard (in Mallett et al., 2020) shows that 75% of employees who implement WFH believe that their productivity is higher at home than in the office. In another study, Redman (in Mallett et al., 2020) also showed that there was a positive relationship between working hours at home with work and life satisfaction, then there was a negative relationship related to fatigue and stress.

Public services in the government sector have also been affected by Covid-19. The Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform (MenPANRB) issued a Circular Letter related to PSBB. Through SE MenPANRB Number 19 of 2020 concerning the Adjustment of the Work System of the State Civil Apparatus in Efforts to Prevent the Spread of Covid-19 in Government Agencies, it is the initial provision for the implementation of WFH for civil servants.

In this SE provision, civil servants in Government Agencies can carry out official duties by working at home/residence (Work From Home) in order to prevent and minimize the spread of COVID-19 for civil servants. The provisions for adjusting the Work System in this SE serve as guidelines for the implementation of WFH for civil servants until March 31, 2020, and will be further evaluated as needed.

In its development, the Minister of PANRB has issued rules on the Adjustment of the ASN work system. SE MenPAN Regulation Number 67 of 2020 to add a map of the risk zone for the spread of Covid-19 issued by the Covid-19 Handling Task Force is still considered relevant so that it is still valid. SE Number 67 is an amendment to SE Number 58/2020 concerning the Work System of ASN Employees in the New Normal Order is still in effect.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number of Sources</th>
<th>Governance (-2.5 to +2.5)</th>
<th>Percentile Rank</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government Effectiveness</td>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>2019</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>60.58</td>
<td>0.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2020</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>64.90</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2021</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0.38</td>
<td>65.38</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 1** Worldwide Governance Indicators

*Asian Journal of Social and Humanities, Vol.1 No.11 August 2023*
Indonesia’s Government Effectiveness released by the World Bank shows an increase since 2019-2021 as shown in the table above. This means that the effectiveness of public services has improved since the pandemic.

The work system during the new normal for civil servants is adapted to flexibility in working location arrangements which is a form of remote working or teleworking. Teleworking offers work flexibility in terms of place and time of work which means, anyone can work from anywhere and anytime as long as the work output produced is on target. Working at home, employees are able to manage stress levels and reduce fatigue, so that later it will create work-life balance. In its own application, home-based work systems are more widely used by those who live far from work (Ollo-López, Goñi-Legaz, & Erro-Garcés, 2021).

In theory, the idea of a flexible work arrangement in choosing a time and place of work is known as a Flexible Working Arrangement or FWA. This flexibility is divided into 1) Flexibility in scheduling working hours, such as alternative work schedules (flex time and compressed workweeks) managing shift and rest schedules; 2) Flexibility in the number of hours worked (part time work and job shares); and 3) Workplace flexibility (working at home or at a satellite location) (Georgetown University Law Center, 2006).

Employees who are given the freedom to work are expected to continue to achieve optimal output, regardless of the achievement process. One of the FWA concepts, WFH, has been widely applied by most civil servants in the context of preventing and controlling the Covid-19 virus in the office environment.

After the Covid-19 Pandemic, the government formulated a new work system policy that manifested in an adaptive work culture and integrity to improve the performance of civil servants in serving the public. Work culture with flexibility in the arrangement where to carry out work for civil servants is expected to provide a comfortable atmosphere in order to increase productivity. Several studies show that the implementation of WFH has a positive impact by finding an increase in work productivity during WFH when conditions and situations are favorable (Simarmata, 2020); (Wahyu & Sa’id, 2020). Other studies show a strong and positive relationship between WFH and work performance (Nasution & Rosanti, 2020); (Ashal, 2020).

Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia (Perpres) Number 21 of 2023 concerning Working Days and Working Hours of Government Agencies and State Civil Apparatus Employees is a legal certainty regarding workplace flexibility for civil servants. In this Presidential Regulation, it is stated that the implementation of official duties flexibly as intended includes flexible in location and / or flexible in time. The types of jobs and ASN employees who can apply flexible in location and / or flexible in time are determined by KDP or agency leaders.

Personnel development officials (PPK) or agency leaders have the authority to determine the type of work and civil servants who can implement the flexible work system. This means that not all civil servants are allowed to use the FWA work system. Further regulations regarding the flexible implementation of the duties of civil servants, including criteria for the type of work, will be regulated in the ministerial regulation.

Anderson (2003) writes "Public policy may be viewed as a political system's response to demands arising from its environment. The environment consists of all phenomena—the social system, the economic system, the biological setting—that are external to the boundaries of the political system.” Based on this understanding, Thomas R. Dye in Dunn (2000: 110) revealed that there are three policy elements that make up
the policy system, namely (a) policy stakeholders, (b) public policy (policy contents), and (c) policy environment (policy environment).

The word "circumstance" is formally defined as "state of affairs" or "sum of essential and environmental factors". In the context of public policy, "circumstance" refers to certain conditions, factors, or variables that are taken into account when formulating, implementing, or evaluating policies. The policy environment is a special setting in which a policy occurs, which is influential and influenced by policy actors and public policy itself.

Presidential Regulation 21 of 2023 as a form of legal certainty over workplace flexibility policies cannot necessarily be implemented by all civil servants. A policy environment needs to be established so that FWA policies can be implemented. The success of the WFH work system during Covid-19 provides experience and learning related to the policy environment that may be created in the new normal atmosphere. This study aims to determine the circumstances or elements that affect the policy-making process such as social, economic, political, environmental, technological, and legal factors that have had a positive impact during the implementation of work flexibility during the pandemic. After the enactment of Presidential Regulation 21 2023, what kind of circumstances should be considered so that the policy can be implemented. So this study will answer the question In what circumstances FWA Possible to be implemented for ASN?

Research methods

In what circumstances, FWA Possible to be implemented for ASN using the method of writing data collection, study literature. In collecting data carried out in the form of collecting and reading data and information from books, journals, reports, publications and scientific articles related to the successful implementation of work flexibility in various government agencies. The qualitative method was chosen with the argument of the availability of research space in the form of depth and sharpness of analysis in revealing phenomena and facts related to In what circumstances FWA Possible to be implemented for ASN

Results and Discussion

In 2004, in the UK, Flexibility Work Arrangement (FWA) was introduced, which is a flexible work system such as part-time, term-time, flexitime, compressed working, annualized working, and job-sharing. However, based on the defects of literature publication, precisely In 1974, preliminary studies on Flexible Working Arrangements (FWA) were identified in the Scopus database. Elbing & Gordon (1974) argue that FWA encourages self-management and employee satisfaction. FWA is a work concept that allows employees to choose when to start work, where to work, and time to stop working using an online platform (Hopkins & Pedwell, 2021). In addition, Hill et al. (2008) further mentioned that FWA has been characterized as the ability of workers to make decisions that affect when, where, and how long they are engaged in work-related tasks. In addition to FWA, the concept of flexibility in working in the literature is referred to by various terms such as Telecommuting, Work-at-Home, WFH, Remote Working, and Flextime.
Based on publication notes from the Scopus database, the study of FWA began to develop since 1999 after some software that can support someone working remotely began to be commercialized and introduced to the public. The growth of publications related to "Flexible Working Arrangements" indexed in the Scopus database from 1999 to 2023 is 233 documents (last taken on June 19, 2023). The peak of research publication occurred in 2021, which was 33 documents, after the implementation of physical distancing of the Covid-19 Pandemic.

![Figure 2 Scientific publication "Flexible Working Arrangements" in the Scopus database](image)

Broadbridge (1999) investigates that FWA can be applied in the business sector, banking, retail, and other fields of work that require managerial abilities. The FWA format at the time was limited to the flexibility of time scheduling to achieve a better work-life balance. Broadbridge (1999) proposed some FWA prerequisites for managers in the retail industry, such as realistic job appraisals. However, this study has limitations on the subjects of interviews that have only been able to be conducted on some managers and employees of the business sector, so the results are limited to specific jobs with specific contexts (Broadbridge, 1999). In the years that followed, studies showed that FWA provided benefits in the banking sector. Mungania, (2016) found that FWA has a positive effect on employee performance. This is due to the flexibility that can be utilized to achieve business goals and facilitate employee effectiveness at work.

Research shows that FWA is generally more desirable among female workers, as it helps them meet their financial needs while still performing their role in the household. At first, FWA was difficult for the boomer generation to accept, but the Covid-19 pandemic has forced a shift in work culture globally (Indarti, 2021).

This pandemic has forced the use of advanced technology and applications in meetings, a more organized and structured work system, and monitoring and evaluation that can be done automatically through certain systems. In addition, teamwork is no longer limited by place and time. The Covid-19 pandemic has prompted significant changes in the way of working and increased acceptance of FWA as a solution to maintain productivity and work-life balance (Fadhila & Wicaksana, 2020).

The development of FWA implementation began to increase significantly when companies tried to remain productive during the COVID-19 pandemic. The
What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be implemented?: A literature review

Implementation of FWA is the most realistic step in order to maintain the sustainability of a company. By implementing FWA, the productivity of a company can continue to run and be able to adjust to government regulations that implement emergency regulations such as lockdowns. Based on the results of research conducted by (Bloom, 2014), the application of FWA actually shows an increase in performance output by one-third because employees who work from home are in a quieter work environment, while working in the office has more distractions. Bloom, (2014) also reported that employees who started work earlier and worked longer, contributed to a two-thirds increase in productivity. However, Bloom, (2014) emphasizes that the FWA system is not suitable for everyone. To be productive while working from home, self-management skills are needed for employees. Bloom, (2014) also argues that FWA is good for people who are old, married, and parented, while young employees whose social lives are more connected to the office are less likely to want to work from home. Bloom, (2014) states that the types of jobs that are suitable for this flexible work system are self-employed workers who are paid by the hour such as call center clerks, manuscript checkers, developers, as well as workers whose work is easily visible or professionals and senior managers who have self-motivation.

Work ecosystem

Flexible Working Arrangement (FWA) work ecosystem refers to a work environment that supports and facilitates the implementation of flexible work arrangements (Kusumaningrum, 2020). FWA covers a wide range of elements and factors that contribute to the success of flexible working arrangements within organizations. The following are some of the components that make up the FWA work ecosystem:

1. Technology Infrastructure

The implementation of Flexibility Working Arrangement (FWA) is inseparable from the challenges and obstacles faced by government agencies and employees who carry out work remotely. One of the common obstacles that is often faced is the availability of workspace and technology infrastructure for every employee who works from home (Fadhila & Wicaksana, 2020). According to (Parker, 2020) not all employees have adequate access to appropriate workspace and technological equipment needed to carry out work effectively.

Adequate technological infrastructure is an important element in supporting FWA. Employees need to have reliable and secure access to hardware, software such as Zoom Meeting, Google Meet, Trello, Slack, and many others that allow and facilitate work without physical meetings (Septyani & Sutarjo, 2022), as well as an internet connection that allows them to work remotely or outside the office. Online communication and collaboration systems are also needed to facilitate communication between team members who work flexibly.

A strong information technology infrastructure also allows safe and secure access to the necessary data and applications. It is important to maintain the confidentiality and security of company information when employees work from different locations. Kshetri, (2017) suggests that technology infrastructure plays a very important role in supporting
the success of digital business. According to him, a good technology infrastructure is the foundation needed to ensure smooth and safe operations in a digital business environment. Kshetri emphasized that a reliable technology infrastructure must be able to manage and protect important company data and information. In the context of FWA, a reliable information technology infrastructure also enables monitoring of performance and productivity, facilitates effective team collaboration, and allows for more flexible management in managing employee schedules and tasks. In addition, with a good information technology infrastructure, organizations can reduce dependence on the physical environment of the office, thereby saving operational costs, reducing the need for physical space, and minimizing environmental impact. With the implementation of FWA supported by advanced information technology, organizations can also become more attractive to prospective employees, especially the younger generation who value work-life balance.

2. Organizational Culture

A supportive organizational culture that encourages flexibility in work is key to FWA’s success. Organizations must create a climate that allows employees to work independently and value work over time spent in the office. A culture that values work-life balance, provides trust to employees, and respects individual needs for flexibility will encourage more effective implementation of FWA (Arini, 2019).

An inclusive and progressive organizational culture will create a work environment that supports flexibility and provides support to employees who wish to run FWA. An inclusive and progressive organizational culture is one in which every employee feels accepted, valued, and supported regardless of their background, differences, or individual preferences (Bharata, Khotijah, & Khabibah, 2021), (Dirgantara & GW, 2022). In the context of implementing FWA, an inclusive and progressive organizational culture creates a work environment that supports flexibility.

In an inclusive organizational culture, every employee has the same opportunity to take advantage of FWA. There is no discrimination or unfair treatment regarding the use of FWA based on factors such as gender, age, marital status, or family role. All employees are valued and given equal opportunities to run FWA according to their personal and work needs. In addition, a progressive organizational culture sees FWA as part of the progress and development of the organization. The implementation of FWA is considered a positive step in improving employee work-life balance, increasing productivity, and creating a more flexible and adaptive work environment. Organizational leaders and management encourage the use of FWA and realize its benefits to employees and the organization.

In an inclusive and progressive organizational culture, there is also strong support from management and organizational leaders for the use of FWA. Management provides clear policies, easy-to-follow procedures, and the resources necessary to support employees who wish to run an FWA. They provide encouragement, understanding, and
In What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be implemented?: A literature review

support to employees who utilize FWA, and involve them in decision-making regarding FWA implementation.

The implication of an inclusive and progressive organizational culture is that employees feel more comfortable and secure to run FWA. They feel supported and valued by the organization, so they can focus and work effectively in carrying out their job responsibilities. This culture also encourages collaboration and cooperation between employees who run FWA and colleagues who work conventionally, thus creating a cooperative and inclusive work environment.

3. Organization Policy

Organizations need to have a clear and structured policy regarding FWA. This policy should include provisions regarding the types of flexible working arrangements that can be applied, application procedures, and requirements that must be met by employees. A clear policy will provide consistent guidelines and provide certainty for employees who want to adopt FWA.

Organizations need to develop policies related to FWA support systems in order to maximize the output produced by employees. One of the policies that can be implemented is a reward and punishment system that is in accordance with the FWA working method. Herzberg (1968) in his theory of how to form employee motivation, states that there are two factors that emphasize the importance of motivation factors in work, including reward, in increasing job satisfaction and motivation. According to him, rewards that meet employees' intrinsic needs, such as recognition, achievement, and career growth, can encourage better performance.

This reward system may include recognition of outstanding performance, additional bonuses or incentives, career development opportunities, or further flexibility in working time arrangements. A reward system that is given fairly and transparently can provide encouragement for team members to achieve targets and feel rewarded for their contributions. This is in line with what was stated by Grant (2008) that a fair and transparent reward system can create a positive work climate and motivate employees to give their best effort. Rewards that are based on real contributions and done with consistency can improve employee performance and sense of engagement. On the other hand, organizations must also have a clear punishment system in FWA. This is not to punish, but to maintain accountability and ensure that team members remain compliant with their responsibilities. The penalties applied must be proportionate and consistent, and must be explained openly to the entire team. This helps prevent abuse of flexibility in FWA and ensures that all team members meet their responsibilities to deliverables. In addition, it is important for organizations to ensure clear communication about the reward and punishment system in FWA. This includes a clear understanding of the criteria and standards used in awarding rewards and penalties, as well as a fair and transparent assessment process. Effective communication ensures that team members have a common understanding of the consequences of their work in FWA. An organization's ability to reward and punish in FWA has a direct impact on team member motivation, performance, and engagement. When rewards and punishments are applied wisely, it can encourage
discipline, responsibility, and high productivity. Organizations that are able to manage rewards and punishments well in the context of FWA will create a work environment that balances flexibility and accountability, and encourages effective achievement of goals.

4. Lead commitment and trust

The leadership's commitment to FWA includes a strong belief and determination in supporting and implementing FWA in the organization. Leaders must recognize the benefits and value of FWA in improving productivity, work-life balance, and employee satisfaction. They should provide concrete support and be actively involved in promoting FWA at all levels of the organization. Leadership commitment is also reflected in the allocation of resources needed to support FWA implementation, such as policy development, employee training, and investment in necessary technology infrastructure.

According to Mayer, Davis and Schoorman (1995) state that high trust between leaders and employees can improve individual and collective performance within organizations. The leader's trust in team members is key in delivering measurable targets. In FWA, team members work with a higher degree of autonomy and have flexibility in carrying out their tasks. Leaders who trust the ability and commitment of team members in achieving goals will provide targets that match individual abilities and still measure performance objectively. Furthermore, leaders need to ensure that the targets given in the FWA can be objectively measured. This means clarifying success parameters and identifying performance indicators that can be quantitatively measured. Thus, team members have a clear understanding of what is expected of them and can monitor their progress independently. In addition, leaders also need to provide the support and resources needed to achieve targets in FWA. This includes providing the necessary tools and technology, providing regular guidance and feedback, and ensuring the accessibility and availability of relevant information. With measurable trust and goals from a leader, team members can feel motivated, accountable, and engaged in achieving company goals. Strong trust builds effective cooperation between leaders and teams in the context of FWA, as well as strengthens mutually beneficial working relationships between the two.

With the implementation of the commitment and trust given by company leaders. Good synergy from each department or division in the company can be maximized by measuring targets that have been well calculated. In addition, a good synergy of trust will be able to form a conducive work environment where mutual trust between leaders and employees can occur harmoniously. This trust includes confidence that employees will fulfill their responsibilities, maintain quality work, and still communicate effectively even when not in the office. Leaders also need to create a culture that supports trust, where employees feel safe and valued while working with flexibility.

5. Managerial Support

Managerial support has an important role to play in influencing individual consequences associated with telecommuting. Adequate managerial support can improve job satisfaction, organizational commitment, job engagement, and psychological well-being of employees who telecommuting. Managerial support in telecommuting includes
In What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be implemented?: A literature review

providing clear direction, supporting effective communication between managers and employees, providing constructive feedback, and providing the resources and support necessary to succeed in remote work (Gajendran and Hoggins, 2007). Managers play an important role in supporting and facilitating FWA in their teams. Managers need to understand the concept of FWA and have skills in managing teams that work flexibly. They need to be able to provide clear direction, provide feedback, and ensure that all team members stay connected and collaborate despite working in different times and places. The direction was conveyed through internal communication, to carry out the implementation of the Flexibility Working Arrangement (FWA) smoothly, it is important for company leaders and management to pay attention to effective internal communication. Good communication in terms of approach and language style that suits the audience is very important so that the information and instructions conveyed can be well received by employees.

Company leaders and management need to ensure that internal communication is carried out effectively in order to create a comfortable and productive work environment. Good communication helps employees to clearly understand their duties and responsibilities in FWA, as well as obtain clear direction for carrying out their work. Efforts in building internal communication are not only to create a comfortable work environment, but also to provide a positive experience and deep understanding for employees who run FWA. Through good communication, every employee will be able to work well and be motivated to provide maximum results in their work (Septyani & Sutarjo, 2022).

6. Human Resource Development

Organizations can provide relevant training and development to employees to help them manage FWA effectively. Mello (2015) states that HR development is an important investment for companies. By developing employee skills and knowledge, companies can increase productivity, innovation, and organizational competitiveness. HR development in the form of skills training can include time management, virtual communication skills, priority setting, and skills needed to work independently. By equipping employees with these skills, they will be better prepared and successful in implementing FWA.

Rothwell & Kazanas (2020) emphasize the importance of HR development in creating a learning culture in the company. By encouraging employees to continue learning and developing themselves, companies can create an innovative, responsive, and adaptive environment. Through effective HR development, companies can help employees develop the skills and competencies necessary to work independently and productively in an FWA environment. This can include training in time management, self-management, virtual communication, online collaboration, and FWA-enabled technologies. In addition, HR development can also help employees to develop skills that are relevant to technological changes and the evolving work environment. This involves investing in employee training and development to deal with new challenges that may arise in working with FWA, such as mastering technological tools, managing remote work, and building interpersonal skills in a virtual context.
Conclusion

Based on the results of this study, it was concluded that the Flexible Working Arrangement (FWA) work ecosystem requires several important components to support its effective implementation within the organization. Adequate technology infrastructure, Organizational culture that supports and encourages flexibility in work, clear and structured organizational policies, Commitment and trust of organizational leaders, and Managerial support and HR development. A well-formed FWA work ecosystem is an important factor that will benefit employees and organizations in implementing FWA successfully.

References

Alipour, Jean Victor, Falck, Oliver, & Schüller, Simone. (2023). Germany’s capacity to work from home. *European Economic Review*, 151, 104354.


Mallett, Oliver, Marks, Abigail, & Skountridaki, Lila. (2020). Where does work belong
In What Circumstances Flexible Working Arrangement Possible to be implemented?: A literature review